

HUGUES N.

TITHING DILEMMA

RESTORING THE TRUTH



YOKABENE

NOT FOR SALE. This work is protected by copyright and is intended for non-commercial use only in all countries. The sharing, printing, distribution, or translation of the work, either in its entirety or in part, must be done freely and without altering the author's original intent, provided you reference its author.

Hugues N.

Tithing Dilemma

Restoring the Truth

An augmented translation of the French edition
titled:

L'identification des dîmes :

Quelle dîme est donc payée par les chrétiens

www.yokabene.fr

yokabene@gmail.com

-NOT FOR SALE-

©Yokabene, 2023
<https://www.yokabene.fr>

ISBN 978-2-9590838-0-8
Legal deposit in France: December 2023

Content Index

Preamble *p.7*

Reading guide *p.8*

Tables of tithes *pp.9-40*

1. Before the law of Moshe (Moses) *p.9*
 - Tithe paid by Abraham or Tithe of the spoil *p.11*
 - Conditional tithe promised by Yaacov *p.11*
2. During the law of Moshe – The first covenant *p.15*
 - Tithe of the Levites (first tithe) *p.17*
 - Tithe of the tithes *p.17*
 - Festival tithe *p.18*
 - The year of tithing or Poor tithe *p.18*
3. During the New Covenant – Nowadays in churches *p.25*
 - Christian tithe or “pastor’s tithe” *p.27*

Appendices *pp.41-54*

1. Particularity of “King Shaul’s tithe” *p.43*
2. Hypotheses on tithing calculation *p.45*
3. Summary table: Biblical tithes vs. church practices *p.47*
4. Warning against false doctrines *p.49*
5. Tithing card template *p.53*

Conclusion *p.55*

List of abbreviations and name concordance *p.56*

List of works by the authors *p.57*

References *p.58*

“But Elohim, who is rich in mercy, for his great love wherewith he loved us, Even when we were dead in sins, hath quickened us together with Christ, (by grace ye are saved;) And hath raised us up together, and made us sit together in heavenly places in Yehoshua Mashiah [Jesus Christ]: That in the ages to come he might shew the exceeding riches of his grace in his kindness toward us through Yehoshua Mashiah.”

Ephesians 2:4-7

Preamble

This work is the English augmented translation of my book “*L’identification des dîmes: quelle dîme est donc payée par les chrétiens?*”, originally published online in French, in September 2014. [The French title means: Tithes identification: Which tithe is paid by Christians?]

The main goal of this book is to explore in depth the topic of tithing considering the Scriptures and to provide insightful perspectives on this controversial issue.

Why did I write this book? After my conversion to the Lord Yehoshua ha Mashiah (Jesus Christ), I became a member of a Protestant assembly in the Paris region in January 2005, where I served actively for over nine years.

In January 2014, the leaders of this assembly demanded that all servants pay tithes. I refused to comply with this obligation. I was no longer convinced of the validity of this form of ecclesiastical tax, which has no scriptural basis. My refusal resulted in my removal from my role within this church.

In response to this experience, I wrote an article addressing the various tithes mentioned in the Bible, which I shared with the leaders of my assembly. Unfortunately, my writings were not met with enthusiasm.

This book provides a comprehensive understanding of the contentious subject of tithing, challenging preconceived ideas.

Reading Guide

The Bible identifies six distinct types of tithes, which I have organised into tables along with explanatory notes and associated verses. Each tithe is categorised into the following separate sections within the tables.

- Before the law of Moshe (Moses)
Two forms of tithing were practised prior to the promulgation of Moshe's law.
- During the law of Moshe
Four other types of tithing were observed during the Mosaic law period.
- During the new covenant
I compare these six tithes with the practice of tithing in the churches.

For each tithe, I specify its name and content, the giver(s) and receiver(s), along with the location and frequency of payment. I examine the purpose behind paying each tithe, exploring the type of commitment expressed by the giver—whether voluntary or mandatory. Additionally, I indicate the ways in which the giver is required to prove the payment.

The explanatory notes provided after each table offer detailed information. Exponent numbers in the tables correspond to these notes. The entire study is justified by biblical verses and, where applicable, supplemented with external historical sources. I use the Bible King James Version (KJV) and I have replaced the name “Jesus Christ” with “Yehoshua (ha) Mashiah”, and “God” with “Elohim”.

1. Before the Law of Moshe (Moses)

Tithe Paid by Abraham or “Tithe of the Spoil”

Conditional Tithe Promised by Yaacov (Jacob)

1. Before the Law of Moshe

Name	Verses	Content	Giver	Receiver	Frequency	Purpose	Payment location	Nature of commitment	Tithe redemption	Proof of payment
Tithe ¹ paid by Abraham or "Tithe of the spoil"	Genesis 14:10-24; Hebrews 7:1-10	The spoil ² The Bible says nothing about its content	Abraham [Levi and the people of Israel (brethren of Levi) through the loins of Abraham]	High Priest Malkiy-Tsedek (Melchisedec) = Yehoshua ha Mashiah from the tribe of Yehudah (Judah)	Only once	Elohim gave Abraham victory over his enemies during a war	Probably not far from the valley of Shaveh, which is the king's dale	Voluntary		
Conditional tithe promised by Yaacov (Jacob)	Genesis 28:10-22; 31:38-41; 35	All that Elohim shall give to Yaacov during his journey	Yaacov	Elohim	Must have been given when Yaacov returned to his father Yitzhak (Isaac) - only once. At least 20 years after his departure from his father's house	On condition that Elohim is with him, guiding him, supplying food, and clothing, and ensuring his safe return to his father's house		Vow, conditional promise		

1. Before the Law of Moshe

Definition

¹The term “*ma`aser*” in Hebrew refers to the tithe, representing the tenth part. It first appears in the Scriptures in Gen. 14:20.

Tithe of the Spoil

²Abraham, along with his servants, waged war and emerged victorious against the kings who had captured his nephew Lot and pillaged the wealth of Sodom and Gomorrah.

The patriarch Abraham voluntarily paid a tenth of the spoil to the Priest Malkiy-Tsedek (Melchisedec).

Abraham’s spoil does not constitute wages earned through labour but rather a war treasure.

The Bible does not specify the contents of the spoil. It is unclear whether the contents were in kind or in money.

Referring to other biblical verses, spoils may include wealth (herds, silver, gold) as well as persons (children and women) (see Genesis 34:27-29; Numbers 31:26, 32-35).

Abraham refused to take anything belonging to the king of Sodom so that he would not say: “*I [king of Sodom] made Abram rich*” (Genesis 14:21-23).

In other words, Abraham returned almost 90% of the remaining spoil to the King of Sodom (except what the young men had eaten, and the portion for those who accompanied Abraham).

The purpose of the tithe payment was that Elohim granted Abraham victory over his enemies.

Abraham did not become wealthy by tithing. He was already rich in cattle, silver, and gold (Genesis 13:2).

In the present times, who would dare to fight against a people in the name of YHWH (Yahweh), seize all their wealth, and then present a tithe from the spoils to Elohim?

This singular act of Abraham's payment of the tithe to Malkiy-Tsedek holds significance.

Malkiy-Tsedek serves as an archetype of Yehoshua ha Mashiah from the tribe of Yehudah (Heb. 7:14-17).

He is described as *“King of righteousness, and after that also King of Salem, which is, King of peace;*

without father, without mother, without descent, having neither beginning of days, nor end of life; but made like unto the Son of Elohim; abideth a priest continually” (Heb. 7:2-3).

Conditional Tithe Promised by Yaacov

Regarding the second reference to the tithe, prior to the law of Moshe, it involves a conditional tithe.

Yaacov left the house of his father Yitzhak (Isaac), for Padanaram to find a wife from Laban's daughters.

Yaacov vowed to tithe everything the Lord provided him during his journey, with the condition that He would protect him and ensure his safe return to his father (Gen. 28:22).

After serving for 20 years in Laban's house (14 years for Rachel and Leah, 6

years for the cattle), Yaacov returned to his father's house. It is not specified whether Yaacov tithed upon his return. If he did, it likely occurred only once.

In the following section, I address the four tithes under the law of Moshe.

2. During the Law of Moshe – The First Covenant

Tithe of the Levites (First Tithe)

Tithe of the Tithes

Festival Tithe

The Year of Tithing or Poor Tithe

2. During the Law of Moshe – The First Covenant

Name	Verses	Content	Giver	Receiver	Frequency	Purpose	Payment location	Nature of commitment	Tithe redemption in money:	Proof of payment
Tithe of the Levites (first tithe)	Leviticus 27:30; Num. 18:5-7, 20-24; Deut. 14:27; Neh. 10:35-39; 13:12-13; Hebrews 7:5	In kind: all the increase of the seed that the field brings forth (corn, new wine, oil)	The people of Israel Farmer Herdsman ³	The children of Levi All priests are Levites, but not all Levites are priests	Once a year Except the 7 th year of the seven-year cycle, and the jubilee year	-Portion of the Levites because they had neither portion nor inheritance among the children of Israel -Service in the temple (tabernacle)	1) Before the exile in Babylon: Tabernacle/ Temple of Jerusalem 2) Return from exile: The cities of tillage	Mandatory	Tithe given in money: value of the product plus one fifth of that value (Lev. 27:31)	
Tithe of the tithes	Num. 18:25-31; Neh. 10:35-39	In kind: corn, new wine, oil	The children of Levi	-High priest (Aaron, son of Aaron from the tribe of Levi) -Priests	Once a year Except the 7 th year of the seven-year cycle, and the jubilee year	-Salary (livelihood) -Temple service	1) Before the exile: Tabernacle/ Temple 2) Return from exile: The cities of tillage The Levites bring their tithes to the chambers within the treasure house of the rebuilt temple	Mandatory	Tithe given in money: value of the product plus one fifth of that value (Lev. 27:31)	

2. During the Law of Moshe – The First Covenant

Name	Verses	Content	Giver	Receiver	Frequency	Purpose	Payment location	Nature of commitment	Tithe redemption	Proof of payment
Festival tithe ⁴	Deut. 12:4-19; 14:22-26	1) In kind: corn, new wine, oil 2) In money: if the road to Jerusalem is too far	The people of Israel Farmer Herdsman ³	The people of Israel eat their own tithe during the feasts	Each year, apparently three times a year Except the 7 th year of the seven-year cycle, and the jubilee year	A moment of rejoicing during the three annual pilgrimage feasts [Unleavened bread (Passover), Pentecost, Tabernacles (Exodus 23:14-17; 34:18-22; Leviticus 23:34-44)]	Temple of Jerusalem Place chosen by Elohim to set His name	Mandatory		
The Year of tithing or Poor tithe ⁴	Deut. 14:28-29; 26:12-13	In kind: corn, new wine, oil	The people of Israel Farmer Herdsman ³	The Levite, the stranger, the orphan, and the widow	Once every three years during the 3 rd and 6 th year of the seven-year cycle	A social security for the needy	Within his gate (= his own town)	Mandatory	Tithe given in money: the product plus one fifth of that value (Lev. 27:31)	The giver had to affirm, before Elohim, that he had kept nothing of this tithe (Deut. 26:13)

2. During the Law of Moshe – The First Covenant

The Seven-Year Cycle

It is worth noting that the tithing system is part of a 50-years period, comprising 7 cycles of 7 years ($7 \times 7 = 49$).

The 7th year of this seven-year cycle is the sabbatical year (also known as the release or *shmita*). The jubilee occurs in the 50th year (Leviticus 25:1-23).

During six years, the Hebrews cultivate the land, prune the vineyards, and harvest the fruits. However, in the 7th year, the land observes a sabbat of rest. Hebrews are not allowed to sow the fields and prune the vineyards.

Regarding the jubilee, it symbolises the liberation of Hebrew slaves and the remission of debts.

Concerning what the Hebrews ate in the 7th year, given that they could not cultivate the land, YHWH promised to bless the 6th year's harvest to sustain them for three years: *"I will command my blessing upon you in the 6th year, and it shall bring forth fruit for three years. And ye shall sow the 8th year and eat yet of old fruit until the 9th year; until her fruits come in ye shall eat of the old store."* (Lev. 25:21-22)

*

Shmita

6th year	7th year	8th year	9th year
Harvest	Sabbat	Harvest	Harvest
Eaten by the Hebrews, produces of the			
6 th y.	6 th y.	6 th and 8 th y.	9 th y.

Shmita Jubilee

48th year	49th year	50th year	51st year (1 st y. of new cycle)
Harvest	Sabbat	Sabbat	Harvest
Eaten by the Hebrews, produces of the			
48 th y.	48 th y.	48 th y.	51 st y.

Legend: y. (year)

Tithes were not given during the 7th year of the cycle, nor in the year of jubilee (Exodus 23:10-11; Leviticus 25:1-2).

³Under the Moshe's law, tithing was done in kind: all the increase of the seed that the field brings forth (corn, new wine, oil). According to other verses,

the tithe concerns the seed of the land, fruit, herd (Leviticus 27:30-32; 2 Chronicles 31:6).

Regarding the herd, every tenth animal was consecrated as a tithe to YHWH. For instance, in a herd of 100 animals, the 10th, 20th, 30th, and so on, up to the 100th animal, constituted the tithe.

Unlike agricultural products, which could be redeemed, the Hebrews were not permitted to redeem the tithe of the herd. The process of tithe redemption involved paying a sum in money, equivalent to the value of the produce, increased by twenty percent (one fifth) of that value (Lev. 27:30-33).

This framework implies that those giving tithes were primarily expected to be farmers and herdsmen, while individuals in other

professions, like fishermen and carpenters, were exempt.

Tithe of the Levites

The people of Israel (11 out of the 12 tribes) were required to annually give a tenth of their produce in kind to the Levites.

The Levites had no portion or inheritance among the Israelites. They were responsible for the temple service, and the tithe supported their livelihood.

As shown in the table, all priests are Levites, but not all Levites are priests. It's noteworthy that the high priest belongs to the family of Aaron.

Tithe of the Tithes

The high priest (Aaron, and his descendants) and the priests received the annual tithe from the Levites.

Festival Tithe

The people of Israel were required to travel to Jerusalem thrice yearly for the pilgrimage feasts (Unleavened Bread/Passover, Pentecost, Tabernacles).

They brought and consumed their tithe, typically in kind, which could be converted into money if the journey to Jerusalem was too distant for the donor to transport their produce. The owner of the tithe *“used that money for whatsoever his soul lusted after, for oxen, sheep, wine, strong drink, or whatsoever his soul desired.”* (Deut. 14:26)

The Year of Tithing or Poor Tithe

Every three years, during the 3rd and 6th years of the seven-year cycle, the Levite, stranger, orphan,

and widow received a tithe for social aid from the people of Israel.

⁴According to Flavius Joseph (AD 37-100), a Jewish historian, Israelites applied both the festival and poor tithes in the 3rd and 6th years of the cycle, totalling 30% of their produce during those years, 20% in addition to the 10% for the Levites (See Appendix 2).

“Besides those two tithes, which I have already said you are to pay every year, the one for the Levites, the other for the festivals, you are to bring every third year a third tithe to be distributed to those that want; to women also that are widows, and to children that are orphans.” [Antiquities of the Jews, 4th book, chapter 8, section 22]

While some scholars hold the view that the festival

tithe was not given in the 3rd and 6th years of the cycle, the historical practices narrated by Flavius Josephus suggest otherwise, with no triennial substitute for the festival tithe in those specific years.

I have adopted this position and provided the chart below.

3 rd year	4 th year	5 th year	6 th year
Tithe of the Levites	Tithe of the Levites	Tithe of the Levites	Tithe of the Levites
Festival tithe	Festival tithe	Festival tithe	Festival tithe
Poor tithe			Poor tithe
30% given by the people	20%	30%	20%

Knowing that churches teach to tithe only 10% of income, have we robbed the Lord? Are we cursed?

The book of Malachi, in chapter 3, is frequently cited by Christian leaders

advocating for tithing. Verses 7 to 10 are repeated with a fervour like a national anthem.

*“Even from the days of your fathers ye are gone away from mine ordinances, and have not kept them. Return unto me, and I will return unto you, saith Lord of hosts. But ye said, Wherein shall we return? Will a man rob Elohim? Yet ye have robbed me. **But ye say, Wherein have we robbed thee? In tithes and offerings. Ye are cursed with a curse: for ye have robbed me, even this whole nation. Bring ye all the tithes into the storehouse, that there may be meat in mine house, and prove me now herewith, saith Lord of hosts, if I will not open you the windows of heaven, and pour you out a blessing, that there shall not be room enough to receive it.”***

I will revisit, later in Section 3 (p.30) of this book, the study of Malachi, chapter 3.

It is important to note that the storehouse corresponds to the chambers for treasures, offerings, first fruits, and tithes, in the temple of Jerusalem (Neh. 12:44).

This does not pertain to any religious building called a church.

Regrettably, driven by the fear of facing a curse, Christian believers feel compelled to bring monthly their tithes in cash based on their income to the religious building.

In the following section, I compare the six types of tithes in the Bible with the contemporary practice of tithing in churches.

3. During the New Covenant – Nowadays in Churches

Christian tithe or “Pastor’s tithe”

3. During the New Covenant⁵ - Nowadays in Churches

Name	Verses	Content	Giver	Receiver	Frequency	Purpose	Payment location	Nature of commitment	Tithe redemption	Proof of payment
"Christian tithe" or "pastor's tithe" ⁶	No Verses Merging of the tithes of the first covenant and human tradition ⁷	-In cash ⁸ : coin, bank note, bank card, cheque -All types of income ⁹ (gross salary ¹⁰ , family allowance, child support, retirement pension, unemployment benefit, study grant, donations, interest on bank savings, etc.)	The parishioners ¹¹ practising all types of professions ¹² Every born-again Christian, child, adult, poor, rich, widow, orphan, stranger ¹³ , every tribe, every nationality... All the ministries: apostle, evangelist, teacher, prophet, sometimes the pastor	The priest ¹¹ = The pastor ¹⁴ of the local church (or even the pastoral body)	Monthly ¹⁵ 12 times a year No seven-year cycle Sabbat and Jubilee years are not observed ¹⁶	-Salary for the pastor's service within the religious building called a church or temple ¹⁷ -Temple maintenance (rent, electricity bills, water, etc.)	Within the church building ¹⁷ The temple can be located in any town -Possible to pay the pastor's tithe by bank transfer or at the "giving kiosk" ¹⁸ -For the benefit of the local church's bank account ¹⁹	For supporters ²⁰ of tithing: it is mandatory Elohim must be tested ²² (Malachi 3:10-11) For opponents, the tithe, which is part of the ceremonial law, had been abolished ²¹	-Hand delivered in front of the believers -Specific envelope for tithes and a special prayer for the giver ²³ -Tithing card ²⁴ -Bank card receipt	

3. During the New Covenant⁵ – Nowadays in Churches

New Covenant Explained

⁵The current division of the Bible often leads readers to misunderstandings.

Some may believe that the Mosaic law (the first covenant) ended upon the beginning of the so-called “New Testament”, specifically, the first verse of Matthew’s Gospel.

However, it is crucial to point out that the “new covenant” began with Yehoshua’s sacrifice on the cross.

As stated in Hebrews 9:16-17, *“for where a testament is, there must also of necessity be the death of the testator. For a testament is of force after men are dead: otherwise, it is of no strength at all while the testator lives.”*

Apart from Hebrews chapter 7, the few references to tithing in the “New Testament” (according to the traditional Bible’s division) occur when Yehoshua reproached the Pharisees for boasting about practising the whole Law, including tithing, while neglecting to demonstrate the love of Elohim, judgement, mercy, and faith (Matthew 23:23; Luke 11:42).

The tithe supporters argue that tithing continues to apply since Yehoshua taught it during his lifetime.

These supporters must understand that Yehoshua, born into the tribe of Yehudah (Judah), was under the law of Moshe (Galatians 4:4).

This fact is the reason why Yehoshua directed the Pharisees to the practice of tithing. The teaching is that the Pharisees were adhering to Jewish traditions and practising religious rituals without showing mercy.

In the parable given by Yehoshua (Luke 18:9-14), who was justified, the Pharisee who tithed or the publican?

“[Yehoshua] spoke this parable unto certain which trusted in themselves that they were righteous, and despised others: Two men went up into the temple to pray; the one a Pharisee, and the other a publican. The Pharisee stood and prayed thus with himself, Elohim, I thank thee, that I am not as other men are, extortioners, unjust, adulterers, or even as this publican. I fast twice in the week, I give tithes of all that

I possess. And the publican, standing afar off, would not lift up so much as his eyes unto heaven, but smote upon his breast, saying, Elohim be merciful to me a sinner. I tell you, this man went down to his house justified rather than the other: for every one that exalts himself shall be abased; and he that humbles himself shall be exalted.”

“Christian Tithe” or “Pastor’s Tithe”

⁶The churches have transitioned from four tithes according to the Mosaic law to one tithe.

This latter does not correspond to any of the four tithes in the law or even to the tithes of Abraham and Yaacov.

Only the pastor of a local church, or the pastoral body, receives the tithe,

corresponding to his monthly salary.

Therefore, I have arbitrarily referred to this tithe as “Christian tithe” or “pastor’s tithe”, which are obviously not biblical terms.

⁷Cyprian of Carthage (AD 200–258) was the first Christian author to mention the practice of financially supporting the clergy. As the Jews supported the Levites under the law of Moshe, he called upon Christians to support the clergy with the tithes. [Pagan Christianity: The Origins of Our Modern Church Practices, Viola]

“In France, the payment of the tithe became a religious obligation in 585 and a civil obligation under Charlemagne (779 and 794). Affecting all landowners, typically amounting to between the eleventh and thirteenth of

agricultural and livestock production, the tithe was intended to enable the Church to provide for the livelihood of the clergy, maintain religious buildings, and assist the poor.”
[www.larousse.fr/encyclopedie/divers/dîme/43554]

Within the Catholic Church, the practice of tithing was abolished by the French Revolution of 1789 in France, and later in other parts of Europe during the 19th century.

In contrast, Protestant churches and other Christian denominations have persisted in the practice of tithing.

⁸Christian believers contribute their tithes in cash.

Under the law of Moshe, tithing in money was permitted only in two cases:

-When the journey to Jerusalem was too far so that the giver was not able to carry his tithe in kind. He was allowed to sell the goods and bring the corresponding money to Jerusalem to rejoice during the religious feasts (Deuteronomy 14:22-26).

-To redeem the tithe, one had to pay the product's value plus a 20% (one fifth) of that value.

⁹Apart from these two exceptions, tithes were typically given in kind, involving agricultural products and livestock as mentioned earlier.

Not all the incomes were subject to tithing, contrasting with Christian practices.

¹⁰In France, the gross salary is the salary before deducting mandatory social contributions, which include

unemployment and retirement contributions, among others.

In the event a Christian is tithing on his gross salary, he is indirectly tithing on his unemployment benefit or retirement pension that he will receive when unemployed or retired. Should he tithe again on the unemployment benefit or retirement pension effectively received at the time of unemployment or retirement? It does not make sense to tithe again since he had already tithed on the gross salary!

¹¹During the first covenant, the priesthood was exclusively reserved for the children of Levi.

This tribe perceived the tithe due to the Levitical priesthood (Hebrews 7:11). Today, every born-again Christian is a priest (1 Peter 2:9; Revelation 1:5-6).

“For the priesthood being changed, there is made of necessity a change also of the law” (Hebrews 7:12).

¹²Not all professions were subject to the tithe. Despite Israel being bordered by the Jordan River and the Mediterranean Sea, the Lord never mentioned tithing on sea products (such as fish). Yehoshua (Jesus), as a carpenter, and Shimon Petros (Simon Peter), as a fisherman, did not tithe on the income from their respective professions.

Malachi chap. 3 explained

¹³Church leaders impose tithing on all social categories, regardless of the donor’s income level.

Unfortunately, widows, orphans, and strangers no longer receive the tithe.

If the poor tithe is not given but instead demanded from

those in need, are Christian leaders not oppressing these individuals?

YHWH warned to judge *“those that oppress the widow, fatherless, turn aside the stranger from his right, and fear not Him”* (Malachi 3:5). The Lord also warned to curse the entire nation because He accused them of deceiving Him (“stealing Him”, according to some translations) in tithes and offerings (Malachi 3:8-9).

The term “tithes” in the above verses is plural due to the diversity of elements it encompasses (products of the soil such as corn, oil, mint, anise, cumin, as well as livestock).

It is crucial to emphasise that the tithe of the Levite is the primary reference. Without the payment of the tithe by the nation of Israel to the Levite, the latter

cannot then contribute with the tithe of the tithe to the priests (including the high priest).

Nehemiah 10:38 specifies that the Levites brought the tithe of the tithes unto the house of Elohim (temple of Jerusalem), to the chambers, into the treasure house (=storage).

Malachi 3 cannot refer to festival tithe, as it is consumed by the individual, nor to the poor tithe, since it benefits widows, strangers, and orphans. These two tithes are not stored in the temple's chambers.

If proponents of the Christian tithe believe that Malachi 3 encompasses all tithes, then why is no tithe being given to those in need?

Is there a Christian who has ever given his tithe to a pagan (=stranger, for the

definition, see Ephesians 2:11-13)?

Considering that the churches do not teach the payment of the poor tithe, are we all deceiving Elohim and therefore being cursed?

The poor, notably those living on \$1 per day, are also oppressed because they tithe on family allowance and solidarity income (such as "*Revenu de Solidarité Active*" in France).

Solidarity income is designed to provide individuals, without resources or with low income, with a minimum level of income that varies depending on their household composition.

¹⁴Why does only the pastor receive the tithe? Is he from the tribe of Levi, son of Aaron? Is he a high priest

(of modern times) according to the order of Aaron or Malkiy-Tsedek?

Why doesn't the pastor (priest) give his tithe to the believers, considering that Christians are also priests?

Please note that the pastor is not a "spiritual Levite". This doctrine is unscriptural (see Appendix 4).

¹⁵Additionally, the monthly payment of the tithe lacks any basis in the Scriptures.

¹⁶Why is the rest of the law of Moshe not observed by Christians leaders, especially the sabbatical and jubilee years?

The Word of Elohim teaches: *"For as many as are of the works of the law are under the curse: for it is written, cursed is every one that continues not in all things which are written in the book of the law to do them"* (Galatians 3:10-11).

See also James 2:10, *"for whosoever shall keep the whole law, and yet offend in one point, he is guilty of all"*.

Nowadays, Jews observe the sabbatical year, but in a controversial manner. During the sabbat year, Jewish landowners sell their land to non-Jews (Arabs, etc.) for a limited period of one year. This allows Jewish landowners to continue working their land. At the end of the year, they regain possession of their land. This is a way to bypass the law related to the sabbatical year. [<http://www.nytimes.com/2000/09/17/opinion/l-israeli-land-and-law-166510.html>]

¹⁷In general, Christian tithing occurs within the church building, in any town.

Contrary to common beliefs, the church building is neither the temple of

Elohim nor His house. In the new covenant, the body of the Christian is the temple of the Holy Spirit. Christians together form the “*ekklesia*” (Greek word for assembly), which is a “spiritual house” (Ephesians 2:19-22; 1 Peter 2:4-6; 1 Corinthians 3:16-17; 2 Corinthians 6:16).

By misuse of language, we say that “*we are going to church*” (the building). It is more accurate to say: “*we are going to meet the Church*” (men and women).

Moreover, uninformed Bible readers associate the term “temple” with the church building, whereas it refers to the temple of Jerusalem. This no longer exists. It was destroyed in 70 AD by the Romans. Only the Western Wall (Wailing Wall) remains today. Yehoshua prophesied about the

destruction of the temple (Matthew 24:1-2).

¹⁸Dr. Marty Baker, the pastor of Stevens Creek Church in Georgia, USA, installed a “Giving kiosk” in his church. The kiosk enables people to contribute through tithes and offerings by using bank cards.

Known as the “ATM for Jesus”, it issues a receipt, and the parishioners may even earn bonus airline miles
[<https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-2006-sep-28-na-holyatm28-story.html>]

¹⁹All tithes are kept in the local church’s bank account. Is this the modern version of the chambers, in the treasure house? (See Neh. 10:38 and Malachi 3)

Arguments: Proponents vs. Opponents

²⁰Among those in favour of tithing, the belief is that the tithe remains in effect, considering it as an everlasting covenant (Numbers 18:19).

On the contrary, opponents argue that many perpetual laws are not observed by “pro-tithe” Christians (Leviticus 23:26-31; 24:8; Numbers 10:8; etc.).

For instance, the celebration of the seven feasts of YHWH, a perpetual law (Leviticus 23:34-41), raises the question: Do they go to Jerusalem every year to observe the pilgrim feasts?

Supporters assert that Yehoshua came not to destroy the law or the prophets but to fulfil them (Matthew 5:17).

Furthermore, many individuals claim to have experienced blessings by faithfully adhering to the practice of tithing.

For opponents, Elohim blesses whoever He wants. Nevertheless, the Lord has provided the Scriptures to serve as a guide with the assistance of the Holy Spirit.

Personal experiences cannot be elevated to the same level as or above the Word of Elohim. Let us be like the Bereans who examined the Scriptures daily to verify the accuracy of what was taught to them (Acts 17:10-11).

Supporters also claim that they are following the example of the tithe paid by Abraham (the father of faith), before the law of Moshe.

They argue that the “pastor’s tithe” should be paid to the person who provides the bread (teaching) and wine.

On the opposing side, it is argued that Yehoshua is the daily bread, and His blood (wine) was shed on the cross for the sins of humanity.

Based solely on the tithe given by Abraham (tithe of the spoil), how is the “pastor’s tithe” established, with its specificities: mandatory, in cash, monthly, applicable to all professions, designated for the pastor, and to be given within the church building?

Despite my persistent inquiries, I am still waiting for convincing answers.

Ceremonial, Moral, and Social/Civil Laws

²¹Moshe’s law can be divided into three

categories: ceremonial, moral, and social/civil laws.

The **ceremonial law** concerns the practices related to the divine service and worldly sanctuary, such as offerings, tithes, and animal sacrifices (Hebrews 9:1). It has existed since Eden when YHWH clothed Adam and Chavah (Eve) with coats of skins. All animal sacrifices foreshadowed the expiatory death of Christ.

The **moral law** remains in effect (Exodus 20:1-17, Ten Commandments; the principle to “*love your neighbour as yourself*”, Galatians 5:14). This law is immutable, put into humankind’s minds, and written in their hearts (Hebrews 8:10).

The **social law** specifically addresses the organization of social life in Israel (Exodus 21; 22; 23:1-9),

covering aspects such as the protection of the stranger, the status of the slave, the prohibition of usury, and the support of widows and orphans (as seen in the poor tithe). The social law is not directly applicable to Christians. However, the underlying moral and ethical principles may be considered relevant for its implementation.

The tithe is no longer applicable due to its connection to the Levitical priesthood, an integral part of the ceremonial law abolished with Yehoshua's sacrifice on the cross (Hebrews 7:12-19; 8:13; 9:1; Galatians 3:10-14; Colossians 2:13-15).

"It is finished" declared Yehoshua, signifying the fulfilment of the ceremonial law. *"For Christ is the end of the law for righteousness to everyone that believeth"* (Romans 10:4).

Non-Biblical Practices

²²A service called "the tithing challenge" is being developed in the United States. The churches, which promote this service, guarantee the parishioner a full refund of his tithe paid over a period of 90 days if, during that period, the Lord has not fulfilled His promise.

[<https://www.life.church/giving/ways/challenge>]

In other words, it is about testing the Lord and thus enjoying the blessings promised in Malachi chap. 3.

Hereafter an extract from the River Crossing Church's terms of the contract:

"I agree that for the three-month period I state below, my household will contribute to Elohim, through Rivers Crossing, a

tithe equal to 10% of our income. At the end of the three-month period, if I am not convinced of faithfulness to bless my life as a result of my obedience to His Word, then I will be entitled to request a refund of the full amount of contributions made during the 90-day period.” [<https://riverscrossing.churchcenter.com/people/forms/419450>]

The “tithing challenge” is quite surprising, as it implies that Elohim’s actions are limited to a quarterly basis. What will happen if the Lord blesses the believer on the 91st day? Who knows the timing of Elohim’s blessings unless it is revealed by the Holy Spirit? Who can impose a deadline on Elohim?

The challenge seems to be based on the conditional

tithe of Yaacov (Gen. 28:10-22).

In response to the concept of the “tithing challenge”, a blogger humorously proposes the “reverse tithing challenge”, summarised by this sentence: *“Give nothing to your church, see if Elohim Indeed curses you!”*

Another practice, called the “reverse tithe”, consists in giving 90% of his income to the church and living on 10%.

The excesses in the teachings of Christian tithing never cease to amaze me (see Appendix 4).

²³How do the assemblies ensure the effective payment of the tithe?

Believers can give their tithe in hand to the pastor. Sometimes “Tithe payers” come forward towards the

pulpit, while “offering givers” remain in their seats.

“Tithe payers” receive a specific prayer that differs from the prayer offered to other church members.

Why do the pastors make a distinction between those who give offerings and those who give tithes?

Nevertheless, YHWH said He shall *“discern between the righteous and the wicked, between him who serves Elohim and him who serves Him not”* (Malachi 3:18)

²⁴An additional method to ensure tithe payment is through a personal tithing card (see Appendix 5).

The card, with 12 boxes for the 12 months of the year, is stamped each month, generally by the church’s accounting department, provided the parishioner is

up to date with the monthly payment. At the end of the year, all boxes must be stamped.

Is this not a form of control over believers?

It is, of course. The goal of all false doctrines aimed at stripping the people, who are passive consumers of sermons.

Appendices

1. Particularity of “King Shaul’s Tithe”
2. Hypotheses on Tithing Calculation
3. Summary Table: Biblical Tithes vs. Church Practices
4. Warning Against False Doctrines
5. Tithing Card Template

Appendix 1. Particularity of “King Shaul’s Tithe”

During the reign of Shaul (Saul) under the law of Moshe

Name	Verses	Content	Giver	Receiver	Frequency	Purpose	Payment location	Nature of commitment	Redeem the tithe	Proof of payment
“King Shaul’s tithe”	1 Sam. 8:5-22; 10	In kind: seed and vineyards	All the people of Israel	The king Shaul His officers and servants		The people of Israel rejected Elohim, their King One of the consequences is the future king collecting the tithe		Mandatory		

Appendix 1. Particularity of “King Shaul’s Tithe”

During the reign of Shaul (Saul) under the law of Moshe

No longer desiring to be under a theocracy, the people of Israel requested a king from the Lord. The prophet Shemuel (Samuel) prophesied to the people the warnings of the Lord, including the future king (Shaul) collecting the tithe.

No biblical verse specifies whether this tithe concerns all the tithes of the law of Moshe, and there is no mention of the effective payment by the people.

It is conceivable that, one day, “pro-tithe” pastors may instruct believers to pay their tithes directly to the current President (the king). I hardly think so, as it could result in a loss of income for those who collect the “pastor’s tithe”.

Appendix 2. Hypotheses on Tithing Calculation

Question A - Are tithes successively calculated on the remaining harvest or on the entire harvest?

Two options: 1. Successive tithes on the remaining harvest;
2. Tithes on the entire harvest.

Question B - Is the festival tithe replaced by the poor tithe in the 3rd and 6th years of the seven-year cycle?

Two hypotheses: a. The poor tithe replaces the festival tithe in the 3rd and 6th years; b. They coexist in those years.

Option 1 – Successive Tithes on the Remaining Harvest

Option 1.a – Poor Tithe Replacing Festival Tithe

Initial harvest: 100

Levitical tithe: $100 - (10\% \times 100) = 90$

Festival or Poor tithe: $90 - (10\% \times 90) = 81$

Total tithe: 19% (1st, 2nd, 4th, 5th, 6th years)

Option 1.b - Coexistence of Poor and Festival Tithes

Initial harvest: 100

Levitical tithe: $100 - (10\% \times 100) = 90$

Festival tithe: $90 - (10\% \times 90) = 81$

Poor tithe: $81 - (10\% \times 81) = 72.9$

Total tithe: 19% (1st, 2nd, 4th, 5th years); 27.1% (3rd, 6th years)

Option 2 – Tithes on the Entire Harvest

Option 2.a - Poor Tithe Replacing Festival Tithe

Initial harvest: 100

Levitical tithe + Festival or Poor tithe: $100 - (20\% \times 100) = 80$

Total tithe: 20% (1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 5th, 6th years)

Option 2.b - Coexistence of Poor and Festival Tithes

Initial harvest: 100

Levitical tithe + Festival tithe: $100 - (20\% \times 100) = 80$

Levitical + Festival + Poor tithes: $100 - (30\% \times 100) = 70$

Total tithe: 20% (1st, 2nd, 4th, 5th years); 30% (3rd, 6th years)

Summary of Options

Option		Rate 1 st , 2 nd , 4 th , 5 th years	Rate 3 rd and 6 th years	Rate 7 th year
Successive tithes on the remaining harvest				
1.a	Poor tithe replacing Festival tithe	19%	19%	0%
1.b	Coexistence of poor and festival tithes	19%	27.1%	0%
Tithes on the entire harvest				
2.a	Poor tithe replacing Festival tithe	20%	20%	0%
2.b	Coexistence of poor and festival tithes	20%	30%	0%

In my study, I have chosen option 2.b, involving tithes on the entire harvest with the coexistence of the poor and festival tithes. The diverse hypotheses reveal that the total tithing rate for the Hebrew people ranges between 19%-30%. Church teachings are based on a rate of 10% (see Appendix 3).

Appendix 3. Summary Table: Biblical Tithes vs. Church Practices

		Day 1	1 st year	2 nd	3 rd	4 th	5 th	6 th	7 th <i>Shmita</i>	8 th	9 th	10 th	11 th	12 th	13 th	14 th <i>Shmita</i>	...20 th	...49 th <i>Shmita</i>	50 th Jubilee	
Before the law of Moshe (Moses)																				
Tithe of the spoil		✓																		
Tithe of Yaacov																	?	?	?	?
During the law of Moshe – the first covenant																				
Paid by the Levite	Tithe of the tithes		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓			
Given by the people	Tithe of the Levites		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓			
	Festival tithe		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓			
	Poor tithe																			
Percentage given by the people of Israel			20 %	20 %	30 %	20 %	20 %	30 %	20 %	20 %	20 %	30 %	20 %	20 %	30 %		30 %			
During the new covenant – human tradition																				
Christian tithe or Pastor's tithe			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Percentage paid by Christian believers			10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %	10 %

Note: The total rate of tithes given by the Hebrew people varies between 19% and 30%, depending on the chosen calculation method (see Appendix 2). Tithes are not given in *shmita* (sabbatical) and jubilee years. The Christian tithe is paid monthly, but for clarity, I have shown it as an annual payment. This doesn't alter the percentage allocated over a year of income.

Appendix 3. Summary Table: Biblical Tithes vs. Church Practices

The six tithes mentioned in the Bible, along with the Christian tithe, are presented in a single summary table. It becomes evident that the practice of tithing in churches is merely a human tradition, unrelated to the Scriptures.

The total rate of tithes given by the Hebrew people varies between 19% and 30%, depending on the chosen calculation method (see Appendix 2). The Christian tithe is paid monthly, but for clarity, I have shown it as an annual payment. This doesn't alter the percentage allocated over a year of income.

As a reminder, the tithing system is part of a period of 50 years, comprising 7 cycles of 7 years ($7 \times 7 = 49$). The 7th year of the seven-year cycle is the sabbatical year (*shmita*). The jubilee is the 50th year (Leviticus 25:1-23). Tithes are not given in *shmita* and jubilee years.

It is important to note that the Hebrew calendar differs from the Gregorian calendar used by Westerners. The last sabbatical year occurred from September 7th, 2021, to September 25th, 2022.

The question arises: Did Christian tithing collectors observe this sabbatical year?

The answer is likely negative, as doing so could result in a loss of income for those collecting the Christian tithe (see also my response in Appendix 1).

Appendix 4. Warning Against False Doctrines

Tithing is often linked to the prosperity gospel promising material blessings. The doctrine is summarised as “*Give to Elohim, receive a hundredfold!*”. False doctrines by “tithivore” preachers include:

Yehoshua ha Mashiah is the tithe of Elohim.

False! Yehoshua, while on earth, was 100% man and 100% Elohim, as in him dwells all the fullness of the Godhead bodily (Col. 2:9).

The pastor is a “spiritual Levite”. The tithe is reserved for him.

False! Which verse states this? The pastor is not a Levite but an individual of American, or French origin, etc...

Nowadays, the tithe must be paid only in cash.

False! The tithe was given in money in two cases:

(i) Tithe redemption. The donor gave in money the value of the product plus twenty percent (one fifth) of that value (Lev. 27:30-33).

(ii) Festival tithe, typically in kind, could be converted to money if the pilgrimage to Jerusalem for the annual feasts was too distant for the donor to transport its produces (Deut. 14:22-26).

Like Abraham who gave a tenth part of all (Heb. 7:2), Christians should give a tithe of all their income.

False! Abraham’s tithe was from war spoil, not labour wages. Christian income does not come from spoils.

If you want to be wealthy, act like Abraham, who became rich by tithing.

False! Abraham was already rich in cattle, silver, and gold (Gen. 13:2) before giving the tithe of spoil.

The Christian's tithe relies on all income, regardless of its source (prostitution, drug, etc.) in line with Lev. 27:33 *"He shall not search whether the animal be good or bad, neither shall he change it."*

Behold! The wage of sin is death (Romans 6:23).

The preacher's right corresponds to the tithe, according to Paulos (Paul).

False! Paulos states a general principle regarding the right of preachers to receive material support from the community.

However, a preacher should not request a monthly salary or material goods, as it may hinder the Gospel, as feared by Paulos, despite his preacher's right (1 Cor. 9).

Only those who preach the Gospel are the priests who lived on tithes and offerings (1 Cor. 9:13-14).

False! All Christians are priests serving Elohim (1 Peter 2:9; Rev. 1:6).

Tithe of time is to dedicate a tenth of one's day (2 hrs 24 mins) to Elohim.

False! No scriptural basis.

Chananyah and Sapphira died for withholding part of their tithe, supposed to be deposited entirely at the apostles' feet.

False! It was the sale of a possession of which the

couple had kept back part of the price (Acts 5:1-11).

Lucifer's downfall to hell is due to not tithing.

False! His heart lifted up due to his beauty. He had corrupted his wisdom (Isaiah 14:11-15; Ezekiel 28:11-19).

The Christians who do not tithe will go to hell.

Stop pressuring and condemning believers!

Appendix 5. Tithing Card Template

"Jésus Christ est le Chef de l'Église, qui est, à la fois, son épouse et son corps."
(Éphésiens 5:23).

Signature du titulaire

Église [REDACTED]

93210 La Plaine Saint Denis - France
Tel: 01 [REDACTED]
Fax: 01 [REDACTED]
Email: [REDACTED]
Site: [REDACTED]

Membre de la CEAEP / Fédération Protestante de France
Association régie par les lois de 1901 et 1905 Agrément
N° [REDACTED] - 922553 Préfecture de Paris - Enregistrement

CARTE DE DIME

Service [REDACTED]

"L'Éternel dit à Moïse: Entre dans l'arche, toi et toute ta maison, car je t'ai vu juste devant moi parmi cette génération!"
Genèse 7:1

Nom :
Prénom :
Date de naissance :
Lieu :
Adresse :
CP :
Ville :
Arrivé à [REDACTED] le :
Baptisé le :
Delivré le : Janvier 2014
A: SAINT DENIS
Pasteurs
[REDACTED]

Année 2014	Cachet
Janvier	
Février	
Mars	
Avril	
Mai	
Juin	
Juillet	
Aout	
Septembre	
Octobre	
Novembre	
Décembre	

The tithing card (*carte de dime* in French) contains blank spaces to be signed and filled in by the cardholder: name, first name, date and place of birth, postal address, date of arrival in the local church, date of baptism.

As previously explained, there is one designated space for each of the twelve months, stamped when the cardholder makes the actual payment of the tithe. The church's accounting closely monitors this process.

I intentionally hid the name and address of the church that created the "tithing card". This church, located in the Paris

region, to which I refer in the preamble of the book, introduced the obligation of holding a tithing card.

That was the trigger for my decision to write an article and subsequently a book on the challenging subject of tithing. Unlike this modern practice, the Hebrews did not maintain a register of donors' names.

The tithing card serves as a means of controlling parishioners, far from the idea of generosity without constraint, as encouraged in 2 Corinthians 9:7.

“Every man according as he purposeth in his heart, so let him give; not grudgingly, or of necessity: for Elohim loveth a cheerful giver.”

Conclusion

The Latin formula “*sola scriptura*” (Scripture alone) no longer seems to be one of the pillars of Protestantism. The Christian tithe is not based on any biblical foundation and constitutes a hazardous mixture between the four tithes of the first covenant and human traditions.

As noted by author Matthew E. Narramore in the preface to “Tithing Low-Realm, Obsolete & Defunct”: “*Tithing is only the tip of the iceberg of the carnal mentalities that dominate most of Christianity.*”

So, how can believers support the Lord’s work without relying on tithing? Each believer is encouraged to contribute willingly, joyfully, and without compulsion (2 Cor. 9:7), based on their means (Acts 11:29), and even beyond (2 Cor. 8:3). This voluntary giving supports those who proclaim the Gospel (1 Cor. 9:7-18) and attends to the needs of the saints (Romans 12:13).

List of Abbreviations and Name Concordance

Books of the Bible

Gen.	Genesis
Exod.	Exodus
Lev.	Leviticus
Num.	Numbers
Deut.	Deuteronomy
1 Sam.	1 Samuel
Neh.	Nehemiah
Mal.	Malachi
1-2 Cor.	Corinthians
Col.	Colossians
Heb.	Hebrews
Rev.	Revelation

Citing the Bible

Chapter	Chap.
Lev. 27:30	Leviticus chapter 27, verse 30
Deut. 14:27; Neh. 10:35-39; 13:12-13	Semicolon when the book or chapter changes.
Num. 18:5-7, 20-24	Only a comma when referring to additional verses in the same book and chapter.

Name Concordance

Chavah	Eve
Elohim	God (traditional translation)
Malkiy-Tsedek	Melchisedec
Moshe	Moses
Shaul	Saul
Shimon Petros	Simon Peter
Shemuel	Samuel
Yaacov	Jacob
Yitzhak	Isaac
Yehoshua ha Mashiah	Jesus Christ
YHWH	Yahweh, Lord

List of Works by the Authors

Hugues & Rodrigue N.

All our books are freely available on our website Yokabene:
<https://www.yokabene.fr/category/ressource/livre>

- English book
 - Prosperity gospel uncovered – December 2023
- French books
 - Des tabernacles au temple : Où est la maison de Dieu ? - 02/08/2019
 - L'amer tue, mort au milieu des vivants - 11/11/2017
 - Vérités et miracles scientifiques du Coran à la lumière de la Bible - 03/02/2015
 - Église et affiche publicitaire : Le culte de l'Homme de Dieu ? - 02/24/2015
 - Entretien avec un chrétien : À qui appartient l'argent ? - 11/11/2014
 - L'identification des dîmes : Quelle dîme est donc payée par les chrétiens ? - 09/16/2014

References

Cover photo credit: Bob Ghost, Unsplash

All the websites have been consulted on November 1st, 2023.

- Bible King James Version (KJV). I have replaced the name “Jesus Christ” with “Yehoshua (ha) Mashiah”, and “God” with “Elohim”.
- Antiquities of the Jews, 4th book, chapter 8, section 22, Flavius Joseph
- At Church, an ATM for Jesus, by Richard Fausset, Los Angeles Times, 28 September 2006,
<http://articles.latimes.com/2006/sep/28/nation/na-holyatm28>
- Contract of the “Tithing Challenge” of the River Crossing Church,
<https://riverscrossing.churchcenter.com/people/forms/419450>
- Histoire de la dîme (History of the tithe), Larousse.fr,
<http://www.larousse.fr/encyclopedie/divers/d%C3%AEme/43554>
- “Israeli Law and Land”, by Saul J. Berman, The New York Times, 17 September 2000,
<http://www.nytimes.com/2000/09/17/opinion/i-israeli-land-and-law-166510.html>
- Pagan Christianity: The Origins of Our Modern Church Practices, Franck A Viola, 31 May 2003
- Picture of a “Giving kiosk”
https://www.yokabene.fr/wp-content/uploads/img/giving_kiosk-403x500.jpg
- Presentation of the “Tithing Challenge” by the River Crossing Church, <https://riverscrossing.com/give>
- Professor Watchdog Issues a “Reverse Tithing Challenge” - Give NOTHING to Your Church, See if God Indeed Curses You!, by FBC Jax Watchdog, 11 October 2012,
<http://fbcjaxwatchdog.blogspot.fr/2012/10/professor-watchdog-issues-reverse.html>
- Shemita, sabbath year, Wikipedia,
<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Shmita>
- Tithing: Low-Realm, Obsolete & Defunct, by Matthew E. Narramore, Tekoa Publishing, 11 May 2004